FACULTY MEETING MOTION

Purple text shows proposed amendments related to the date that tenure candidates are notified of the recommendation that will be made to the Board of Trustees (page 6)

Amendment: The Committee on Appointments, Promotions, and Tenure moves to amend the motion of December 1, 2017, by substitution with the following language and provisos:

Motion: The Committee on Appointments, Promotions, and Tenure, and the Dean of the Faculty's Office moves to (1) adopt the proposal to reconfigure the structure of the Committee on Appointments, Promotion, and Tenure (CAPT) and rename CAPT as COT (the Committee on Appointments and Tenure with seven members), (2) to create a separate five member Committee on Promotions to Associate and Professor (COP), (3) to alter the (proposed) COT calendar, and (4) to create a COP calendar, and (5) to amend the Faculty Handbook to reflect the approved changes.

p. 111

Endowed Chairs are appointed by the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs in consultation with CAPT the Committee on Promotions (COP), the Department, and, when applicable, the Program concerned. Appointment to an endowed chair is a mark of distinction conferred by the institution upon a current faculty member or, less typically, upon a faculty member expressly hired into the chair. Term lengths may vary in accordance with donor wishes and program needs. Support for endowed chairs may enable the College to appoint individual faculty in several rotating configurations: rotation within a department or discipline or rotation across departments in a division, e.g., the sciences, the humanities, etc. Support for endowed chairs may also make possible residencies of varying lengths to allow programs at the College to supplement current offerings.

Page 113 [VIII EVALUATION OF FACULTY FOR CONTINUED SERVICE AND ADVANCEMENT IN RANK: Preamble]

The standards by which Departments, Programs, CAPT COT, COP, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs, the President, and the Board of Trustees

arrive at their judgments regarding continuing service and advancement in rank are necessarily community-based. Therefore, the judgments of departments and programs, and especially CAPT COT, COP, as the bodies elected by the faculty to represent the faculty in matters of promotion and tenure, necessarily set the standards for reappointment, tenure, and promotion at Skidmore College.

Page 114 (A. Tenured and Tenure-Track Faculty)

This section of the Handbook sets out the criteria and standards that ground judgments regarding reappointment, tenure, and promotion in academic rank. It also discusses the kinds of evidence to be used by departments and programs; CAPT COT; COP; the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs); the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs; the President; and, ultimately, the Board of Trustees in making those judgments through the process of faculty review.

Page 121 (A. Third Year; iv.)

If the recommendations of the department and the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) differ, CAPT COT will review the candidate's file and make a third recommendation to the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs. This recommendation will be made on or before February 25.

Page 125f. (2. Institutional Considerations)

Candidates should be aware that the Administration and Board of Trustees may review tenure recommendations presented by CAPT COT and make their decisions in light of larger institutional and budgetary considerations. The Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs is responsible for providing notification in writing to tenure-track faculty and their departments of probable structural barriers to tenure at the earliest possible date, beginning with the time of the third-year review.

Page 126. (Eligibility)

d. When institutional needs or priorities require it, the College may hire, with tenure, a faculty member who has achieved the rank of Associate Professor or Professor and who has been tenured at a previous institution. In such a situation, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs and the hiring department/program must

present the merits of the case to CAPT COT prior to any offer being made. A candidate may be evaluated for an immediate award of tenure by the following procedure. The hiring department chair/program director will present the credentials of the candidate to CAPT COT. The Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs will accompany the department chair/program director to the presentation and offer information related to institutional need/priorities. CAPT COT will deliberate according to those qualifications stipulated in the Faculty Handbook, Part One (Faculty Rights and Responsibilities), Article VIII (Evaluation of Faculty for Continued Service and Advancement in Rank), Section A (Tenure-Track Faculty), and Section E. (Tenure) number 3 (Eligibility). Should CAPT COT recommend against tenure, the department, in consultation with the DOF/VPAA, may still hire the candidate on the accelerated tenure clock described in paragraph c above.

Page 126 (Criteria for Determining Years of Service)

a. For faculty members, the service year coincides with the academic year. The academic year begins at the start of the fall term and ends with the close of the spring term. For each academic year that a faculty member holds a full-time appointment, that person will be considered to have given a year of service. Other than those Visiting Lecturers described above, faculty members who move from "visiting" to "tenure-track" status may choose, in consultation with the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs and CAPT COT, to have or not to have the "visiting" years count toward tenure; the decision must be specified in the letter of appointment to the tenure-track position.

Page 127f (5. <u>Procedures for granting tenure</u>)

- 5. Procedures for Granting Tenure
 - a. The decision to grant tenure rests with the Board of Trustees. The Board acts upon the recommendation of the President who in turn acts in consultation with the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs, the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs), the Chair(s) of the department(s) concerned, and CAPT-COT.
 - b. CAPT COT shall annually disseminate its calendar, its operating code, and the operating codes of the Tenure Appeal Committee to all faculty.
 - c. CAPT COT has the responsibility of securing information with respect to the candidate's teaching competence, professional accomplishment, and service to the

academic community. Sources of this information include:

- i. Full-time faculty and those holding shared appointments in the department concerned (in the ranks defined in Part One [Faculty Rights and Responsibilities], Article VI [Appointments to the Faculty], Sections A [Tenure-Track Appointments] and E [Non-Tenure-Track Appointments], number 2b [Artist- or Writer-in-Residence]) who are in at least their third year of full-time service at Skidmore;
- ii. Department Chair;
- iii. Program Directors (where appropriate);
- iv. For tenure-track faculty appointments that are 100 percent in ID programs, CAPT COT will secure information concerning a candidate in an ID program from all members of the ID Program Personnel Committee. The Program Director (or PPC Chair if the Director is the candidate) will represent the Program position with regard to tenure.
- v. For proportional tenure-track faculty appointments that are shared between two departments, a department and an ID program or two ID programs, CAPT COT will secure information concerning a candidate from all members of the ID Program Personnel Committee(s) and from all faculty in the department(s) involved. The Department Chair will represent the department's position and the Program Director(s) (or PPC Chair if the Director is the candidate) will represent the Program(s) position.
- vi. Sources suggested by the candidate under consideration including Administrative Officers, the Coordinator, or Director of a program or Chair of a department in case the candidate has taught in an interdisciplinary program or department other than the one in which the candidate holds an appointment;
- vii. Materials related to teaching effectiveness, professional accomplishment, and college service submitted by the candidate under consideration;
- viii. Teaching evaluations. The Department Chair shall bring to the attention of CAPT COT student and faculty opinion concerning the faculty member as a teacher and shall indicate the procedures employed in obtaining such information, including class visitation procedures. Classroom visitations are a mandatory part of the process, except in those cases in which the candidate is hired with tenure. For further guidance, see Part One [Faculty Rights and Responsibilities], Article VII [Rights, Obligations, and Responsibilities of All Faculty], Section C [Academic Responsibilities], number 7 [Student Evaluations]) and Part Two

[Governance], Article III [Academic Policies], Section E [Peer Evaluations of Teaching] and Section F [Student Evaluations].

ix. Annual reports prepared by the candidate citing activities each year such as new courses, new methods, research, creative work, professional activities, community service. All information is sent to the Chair of CAPT COT and kept in a confidential file in the President's Office (or the CAPT COT Reading Room) as required by law.

d. Unsolicited letters received by CAPT COT must be signed and must address themselves to one or more of the evaluative criteria for continued service as delineated in the Faculty Handbook. Such letters will be stored in a confidential file labeled "Unsolicited Letters" and kept in the President's Office (or the CAPT COT Reading Room) as required by law. Within seven days of the date stipulated by the annual CAPT COT calendar for receipt of all letters, the Chair of CAPT COT will give the candidate a list of names of those who have written unsolicited letters about the candidate.

Page 129 (replacing item f)

f. After conducting its deliberations, CAPT COT reports its recommendations to the President and the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs. The Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs then consults with the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs). In the event of a disagreement between the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs and CAPT COT, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs and the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) meet with CAPT COT to offer detailed and compelling reasons for such disagreement. The Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs then makes a recommendation to the President, and notifies COT cot of the recommendation. In the rare instance in which the President does not concur with the recommendations of CAPT COT, the President meets with CAPT COT to offer detailed and compelling reasons for such disagreement. Finally, the President's recommendations are reported to the Academic Affairs Committee (AAC) of the Board of Trustees, and CAPT COT informs the AAC of the recommendations it made to the President.

g. Notice of the recommendation that the President will make to the AAC must be given to the candidate no later than March 1 of the appropriate year. Notice of the Board of Trustees' decision regarding tenure must be given on or before March 1 May 31st of the appropriate year. Tenure status is effective immediately. Promotion to Associate Professor is automatic with the granting of tenure and is effective on June 1 of the year the decision is made.

Page 129 item k

k. Any member of the Faculty who is considered for tenure by CAPT the Committee on Appointments and Tenure (COT) and the Administration shall be granted an additional but terminal year in the event that tenure is not granted. Similarly, an additional terminal year will be granted to any member of the Faculty who is eligible to stand for tenure but elects not to do so.

Page 129f item l

l. A candidate for the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs may be evaluated for an immediate award of tenure by the following procedure. The President will present the credentials of the candidate for Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs and evidence for both appointment as Professor and awarding of tenure to the academic department(s) appropriate to the candidate's professional field. At the same time, the President will also furnish the candidate's credentials and evidence to CAPT. The qualifications for tenure are those stipulated in the Faculty Handbook, Part One (Faculty Rights and Responsibilities), Article VIII (Evaluation of Faculty for Continued Service and Advancement in Rank), Section A (Tenure-Track Faculty), and Section E.

(Tenure) number 3 (Eligibility). The Chair of the academic department to which the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs will be appointed forwards a written departmental recommendation to CAPT-COT. Simultaneously, CAPT COT solicits individual written recommendations from all members in that same department. These procedures correspond to those for tenure candidacy and evaluation specified in the Faculty Handbook, Part One (Faculty Rights and Responsibilities), Article VII (Evaluation of Faculty for Continued Service and Advancement in Rank), Section E (Tenure), number 5 (Procedures for Granting Tenure), but may reasonably exclude the stipulations in c.i, c.ix, e.i, e.ii, g, and j. Then, as in Part One (Faculty Rights and Responsibilities), Article VIII (Evaluation of Faculty for Continued Service and Advancement in Rank), Section E (Tenure), number 5 (Procedures for Granting Tenure), f, and Section F (Promotion), number 2 (Procedures for Promotion), CAPT COT makes a recommendation to the President, who reports to the Board of Trustees.

page 130 and forward

6. Review of Negative Tenure Decisions

- a. A faculty member who is denied tenure but believes that the case received inadequate consideration may petition the Tenure Review Board ("TRB") for a review. Such a review must be requested by March 21 of the academic year following the semester in which CAPT COT completed its consideration of the case. The candidate must submit to the TRB a letter stating in a clear and concise manner exactly how the consideration of the case is perceived as having been inadequate.
- b. The Tenure Review Board consists of three tenured members of the Faculty, at least one of whom shall have previously served on CAPT COT, each from a different department and elected for a three-year term. No member of a candidate's department will sit on the TRB for consideration of the case. The Faculty Executive Committee, according to its procedures, shall provide an alternate for any of the three whose department is the same as the candidate's.
- c. The Tenure Review Board will have at its disposal all of the materials contained in the original tenure file which was were available to CAPT COT, together with the letter referred to in number 1 above. No other materials may be added, and the TRB will restrict its inquiry to the area or areas of consideration claimed in the candidate's letter to have been inadequate. The TRB may consult with CAPT COT, members of the candidate's department, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs; the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs); and others deemed necessary by the TRB to assess the petition. The Board shall be bound by confidentiality.
- d. The Tenure Review Board will convey its recommendation to the President, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs, CAPT COT, the department Chair or program Director, and the candidate within four weeks of the deadline by April 1. If the Tenure Review Board has determined that the case merits reconsideration, the Chair of CAPT COT shall initiate the review by convening the Tenure Appeal Committee (TAC), a committee consisting of the six seven members of CAPT COT plus the three members of the Tenure Review Board.

7. Appeal of Negative Tenure Decisions

a. If the Tenure Review Board determines that a tenure case requires reconsideration, the three members of the Tenure Review Board will sit together with the six seven members of the CAPT COT to reconsider the case. The Tenure

Appeal Committee will have access to the written information which the CAPT COT had in its original deliberations and any additional material specifically pertaining to the area or areas of consideration deemed inadequate by the TRB. The deadline for submission of additional materials shall be April 15. specified by in the CAPT Calendar, but shall not be sooner than February 15 nor later than March 15.

- b. The Tenure Appeal Committee will hear testimony from an advocate designated by the candidate. The advocate may be a person in the candidate's department, the candidate's Chair, a Skidmore faculty member outside the candidate's department, or someone outside the College. The advocate may not be an attorney. By request, the advocate may be informed why tenure was not initially recommended by CAPT COT and/or the President at a joint meeting of the President, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs, the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs), the Chair of CAPT COT, the candidate, and the advocate. The advocate, in the presence of the candidate, has the right of access but may not photocopy the materials which CAPT COT had in its original deliberations. Whenever testimony is given by the candidate or the advocate, both shall be present.
- c. The Tenure Appeal Committee may consult with the President, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs, the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs), or members of the candidate's department at any time.
- d. The operating procedures to be followed by the Tenure Appeal Committee will be made available to the candidate well in advance of the proceedings. The Chair of CAPT COT shall preside over appeal proceedings.
- e. The Tenure Appeal Committee shall conduct a review only once.
- f. The Tenure Appeal Committee shall convey its written recommendation based on a simple majority vote of the nine ten members to the President upon completing its deliberations. This recommendation shall be made to the President no later than May 1.
- g. The President shall decide about appropriate action and shall convey the result of a review in a letter to the candidate, and shall state therein the reasons for recommending or not recommending tenure. The letter will be sent within 10 days of receipt of the Tenure Appeal Committee's recommendation, with copies to the Tenure Appeal Committee and the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs

p. 131 item b

F. Promotion

1. Guidelines for Advancement in Rank

- a. Promotion at Skidmore is awarded not on the basis of time in rank but because of the candidate's demonstration of accomplishments that satisfy the applicable standards at the level specified for the desired rank. Faculty may stand for promotion at their discretion.
- b. For the rank of Associate Professor, the appropriate terminal degree (or its professional equivalent) normally is required. The absence of the appropriate terminal degree is not an absolute deterrent to advancement to any rank. Other qualifications, however, shall be closely scrutinized by the department, CAPT COP, and the administration for evidence of extraordinary merit.

Page 132 forward

2. Procedures for Promotion

a. Professorial Ranks

- i. Promotions are granted by the Board of Trustees upon the recommendation of the President, who consults as necessary with the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs, the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs), CAPT COP, and the Chair of the department concerned. Except in the case of the Library faculty, CAPT COP's role in promotion is limited to full-time and shared tenure-track appointments to professorial ranks.
- ii. Faculty may stand for promotion at their discretion. Consideration for promotion may be initiated by the Department Chair in consultation with the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs), CAPT, COP. The Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) in consultation with the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs may also decide to nominate a candidate for promotion consideration. In such

- a case, the department is obliged to consider the candidate's credentials and to present its recommendation to CAPT COP. Nomination by the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) for such consideration does not presuppose a successful outcome for the candidate. The Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) may initiate promotional consideration in the case of Department Chairs. The Department Chair or the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) shall indicate the consultation procedures employed within the department when recommending a promotion.
- iii. By March 15, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs shall provide Department Chairs with a list of faculty in their departments who have been at the rank of Associate Professor for seven years or more. The Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs shall provide CAPT COP with a list of all faculty who have been at the rank of Associate Professor for seven years or more. All Chairs shall assess eligibility of Associate Professors at least every two years after they have served seven years in rank.
- iv. In the case of a promotion candidate appointed 100 percent to an ID program, the ID Program Director shall perform those functions normally assumed by a Department Chair, and faculty on the ID PPC shall be consulted and shall write letters. All these letters shall be forwarded to CAPT COP.
- v. For proportional tenure-track faculty appointments that are shared between two departments, a department and an ID program or two ID programs, CAPT COP will secure information concerning a candidate from all members of the ID Program Personnel Committee(s) and from all faculty in the department(s) involved. The Department Chair will represent the department's position and the Program Director(s) (or PPC Chair if the Director is the candidate) will represent the Program(s) position.
 - vi Candidates being considered for promotion shall be sent a written notice by the Chair of CAPT COP that they are candidates for promotion.
 - vii All full-time faculty and those holding shared appointments in the departments concerned and in at least their third year of service (in ranks defined in Part One, Article VI [Appointments to the Faculty], Sections A [Tenure-Track Appointments] and E [Non-Tenure-Track Appointments], number 2b [Artist- or Writer-in-Residence] shall be consulted and shall write letters to the Chair. The Department Chair must also request letters from Program Directors and from other Department Chairs if the candidate has offered courses in other programs or departments. Individuals writing letters of evaluation for the candidate shall clearly

state whether they do or do not recommend promotion, and why, according to the criteria for continued service. The Chair's letter shall present the Chair's individual position as well as the department's. All these letters shall be forwarded to CAPT COP. In the case of a promotion candidate appointed to an ID Program, the ID Program Director shall perform those functions normally assumed by a Department Chair, and faculty on the ID PPC shall be consulted and shall write letters. All these letters shall be forwarded to CAPT COP.

viii. Promotion files shall include the following:

- (1) an updated CV, which makes clear what has been achieved since the last promotion.
- (2) all scholarly, creative, or professional materials produced since the last promotion; candidates may add some earlier materials for purposes of context or to show continued growth. Candidates may wish to seek letters from Skidmore colleagues outside their department qualified to speak to their professional accomplishment. Candidates may also wish to include a statement about achievements and works in progress.
- (3) the ten most recent consecutive semesters of teaching evaluations. For purposes of context, the candidate may wish to include other evaluations. The candidate shall also add copies of syllabi, and may include assignments and handouts. The candidate may also wish to append a statement about teaching goals and philosophy. The file may include peer evaluations of teaching.
 - (4) a cover sheet showing courses taught, sabbatical leaves, and any course releases over the previous six years.
 - (5) service credentials presented within the context of the broad statements about service in Part One (Faculty Rights and Responsibilities),

- ix. Candidates for promotion may solicit letters on their behalf from reviewers familiar with their credentials from outside the college. Such letters may come directly to COP, or go to the Department Chair and then to CAPT COP as part of the candidate's dossier. Letters mandated by the department must also be transmitted to CAPT COP.
- After conducting its deliberations, CAPT COP reports its recommendations to the X. President, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs, and the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs). The Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs then consults with the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs). In the event of a disagreement between the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs and CAPT-COP, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs and the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) meet with CAPT COP to offer detailed and compelling reasons for such disagreement. The Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs then makes a recommendation to the President, and notifies CAPT COP of the recommendation. In the rare instance in which the President does not concur with the recommendations of CAPT COP, the President meets with CAPT COP to offer detailed and compelling reasons for such disagreement. Finally, the President's recommendations are reported to the Academic Affairs Committee (AAC) of the Board of Trustees, and CAPT COP informs the AAC of the recommendations it made to the President.
- xi. In the event that CAPT COP forwards a negative recommendation to the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs in a promotion case, CAPT COP will also notify the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) of the reasons for the recommendation. The Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) will present the reasons for a negative recommendation to the candidate. In the event that the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs or the President forward a negative recommendation, the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) and CAPT COP will be notified of the reasons for the recommendation. The Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs will present the reasons for a negative recommendation to the candidate.

[Revisions to 2. Faculty Governance Committees]

Page 211ff.

c. COMMITTEE ON APPOINTMENTS, PROMOTIONS, AND TENURE (CAPTCOT) — Elected

Function: To represent the Faculty on administrative appointments and reviews and on faculty appointments, promotions (related to the tenure process), and tenure, and to make recommendations on these matters to the appropriate administrative officer. The Administration shall consult CAPT-COT to determine which administrative personnel decisions the committee judges to require faculty representation. Special meetings with the President, the Dean of the Faculty/Vice President for Academic Affairs, and the Associate Dean of the Faculty (faculty affairs) may be called at the request of any of these administrative officers or the committee. At least one meeting of the joint trustee-faculty committee is held during each academic year. Revisions to some parts of Part One (Faculty Rights and Responsibilities) of the Faculty Handbook are reviewed by CAPT COT for its recommendations prior to a faculty vote.

Membership: Six Seven faculty members with tenure, at least one each from the different divisions and no two from the same department, chosen from the ranks of Professor and Associate Professor, none of whom is on the Tenure Review Board, CAFR, COP, or FAB, elected to serve three-year terms; replacements for such cases will be selected from recent members of CAPT, COT and the Tenure Review Board (or its predecessor, the CAPT Review Committee). The first eligible faculty member will be chosen from a list beginning with the most recent past members of the named groups (eligible replacements must have reviewed at least one case).

A member who has served a full three-year term is eligible for re-election after being out of office for two years; members who complete an unexpired term or serve an interim term in place of a regularly elected member on leave are immediately eligible for re-election provided the service does not exceed one calendar year.

Members of COT may not participate in the tenure or promotion cases of candidates in their own departments/programs and a substitution will be made.

[Page 211. Insert between COT and CAFR and renumber subsequent sections accordingly]

d. COMMITTEE ON PROMOTIONS (COP) — Elected

Function: To represent the Faculty on promotion cases to Professor and pre-tenure promotions to Associate Professor.

Membership: Five faculty members with tenure, at least one of whom must come from each of the four divisions, none of whom is on the Tenure Review Board, CAFR, COP, or FAB, elected to serve three-year terms. Members of COP may not participate in the

promotion cases of candidates in their own departments.

Page 212 g & h.

gh. TENURE REVIEW BOARD — Elected

Function: To review a negative tenure recommendation at the request of the candidate. In the event that the Tenure Review Board determines that a tenure case requires reconsideration, the three members of the TRB will sit together with the seven members of CAPTCOT, as the Tenure Appeal Committee, to reconsider the case.

Membership: Three tenured faculty members, each elected to serve a three-year term, at least one of whom has previously served on CAPT or COT. All members of the Board must have been tenured for at least two years. No two members may be from the same department. Faculty currently serving on CAPTCOT, COP, CAFR, or FAB are not eligible. No member of the Tenure Review Board may sit for the review of a candidate in the same department. FEC will provide replacements for such reviews as needed.

hi. TENURE APPEAL COMMITTEE

Function: To review a negative tenure recommendation at the request of the Tenure Review Board.

Membership: The seven members of CAPT-COT plus the three members of the Tenure Review Board. No member of the Tenure Appeal Committee may sit for the review of a candidate in the same department. FEC will provide replacements for such reviews as needed.